



## **Guidelines for Assessment of Effectiveness of Teaching in Tenure, Continuing Status, and Promotion Decisions**

The Lawrence S. Bloomberg Faculty of Nursing (Faculty of Nursing) is committed to excellence in teaching. In the Faculty of Nursing, faculty members facilitate student learning across undergraduate and graduate programs to be outstanding nurses, effective nurse leaders in practice (clinical, administrative, education, and research), and leaders in developing knowledge. The Faculty believes that teaching effectiveness leads to student engagement and learning.

Evaluation of teaching is relevant to decisions on tenure and promotion in the tenure stream (including the transition from Assistant Professor to Associate Professor, and from Associate Professor to Professor) as well as to continuing status review and promotion in the teaching stream (including the transition from Assistant Professor, Teaching Stream to Associate Professor, Teaching Stream, and from Associate Professor, Teaching Stream to Professor, Teaching Stream). The standards and procedures to be followed and the documentation to be collected for each of these reviews are laid out in detail in relevant university policies and guidelines:

- *Policy and Procedures on Academic Appointments* (June 26<sup>th</sup> 2015)
- *Policy and Procedures Governing Promotions* (April 20<sup>th</sup> 1980)
- *Policy and Procedures Governing Promotions in the Teaching Stream* (December 20, 2016)
- *Provostial Guidelines for Developing Written Assessments of Effectiveness of Teaching in Promotion and Tenure Decisions* (May 14, 2003).

The purposes of the Faculty of Nursing Guidelines for Assessment of Effectiveness of Teaching in Tenure, Continuing Status, and Promotion Decisions are to summarize criteria for each of the aforementioned reviews, to describe how teaching effectiveness and related criteria are assessed, and to identify what documentation should be collected to support relevant assessments.

These guidelines include three parts:

- Part 1: Assessment of Teaching Effectiveness for Tenure Stream Faculty
- Part 2: Assessment of Teaching Effectiveness for Teaching Stream Faculty
- Part 3: Documentation and Evaluation.

Parts 1 and 3 are relevant for reviews involving tenure stream faculty. Parts 2 and 3 apply to faculty in the teaching stream.

## **PART 1: ASSESSMENT OF TEACHING EFFECTIVENESS FOR TENURE STREAM FACULTY**

### **1.1 Tenure Review and Promotion Criteria for Tenure Stream Faculty**

For tenure stream faculty, The *Policy and Procedures on Academic Appointments (2015)* (Section 3, Part 13) outlines the criteria relative to tenure as follows:

*Tenured appointments should be granted on the basis of three essential criteria: achievement in research and creative professional work, effectiveness in teaching, and clear promise of future intellectual and professional development. Contributions in the area of university service may constitute a fourth factor in the tenure decision but should not, in general, receive a particularly significant weighting.*

A positive recommendation for tenure and promotion to Associate Professor requires the judgement of demonstrated excellence in one of research and teaching, and clearly established competence in the other. Clear promise of future intellectual and professional development must also be affirmed.

The *Policy and Procedures Governing Promotions (1980)* (Part 7) outlines criteria to be used for promotion to the rank of Professor for faculty in the tenure stream:

*The successful candidate for promotion will be expected to have established a wide reputation in his or her field of interest, to be deeply engaged in scholarly work, and to have shown himself or herself to be an effective teacher. These are the main criteria. However, either excellent teaching alone or excellent scholarship alone, sustained over many years, could also in itself justify eventual promotion to the rank of Professor. Administrative or other service to the University and related activities will be taken into account in assessing candidates for promotion, but given less weight than the main criteria: promotion will not be based primarily on such service.*

### **1.2 Criteria for Assessment of Teaching Effectiveness for Tenure Stream Faculty**

Tenure stream faculty demonstrate their effectiveness as teachers in a number of teaching and learning contexts including classroom teaching / lecturing, on-line teaching, teaching in seminars and tutorials, teaching in the simulation laboratory, clinical teaching or supervision within assigned courses, individual teaching, delivery of workshops, supervision of students, and any other means by which students derive educational benefit. For tenure, faculty must demonstrate competence or excellence. For promotion in the tenure stream, faculty must demonstrate effectiveness in teaching which at a minimum requires a demonstration of competence.

## ***A. Competence in Teaching***

To establish ***competence*** in teaching, faculty members must demonstrate that they:

### **1. Enact the fundamental duties of a university teacher by**

- Demonstrating mastery of the subject matter(s) being taught / learned by students
- Using effective communication skills in teaching and learning
- Being accessible to students
- Consistently dealing equitably and ethically with all students
- Demonstrating professionalism and adhering to academic standards as defined by the University of Toronto and the Faculty of Nursing
- Creating and sustaining student supervisory conditions that are conducive to students' academic progress, intellectual growth, and development, particularly with regards to PhD students
- Developing and applying research knowledge and skills.

### **2. Use teaching practices that promote student learning by**

- Communicating academic materials effectively, including professional knowledge
- Challenging and stimulating students to promote their intellectual and scholarly development
- Assisting students to master the subject area(s) being taught
- Using meaningful methods of assessment
- Providing timely constructive feedback to students
- Engaging students in the learning process
- Using student feedback and student outcomes to enhance own teaching practices.

### **3. Actively engage in curriculum development by**

- Demonstrating understanding of the context of one's own course(s) within the broader curriculum as well as in relation to curricular developments across Faculty programs
- Respecting program integrity and requirements
- Ensuring that course curricula reflect current and relevant research and practice in the fields of nursing and health care in general.

### **4. Engage in professional development that supports one's effectiveness as a teacher, nurse or leader by**

- Engaging in developmental opportunities to enhance one's teaching practices
- Reflecting on and striving for improvement in teaching activities
- Drawing on current research and other developments in one's field to advance student learning and to enrich one's own teaching.

## ***B. Excellence in Teaching***

To meet the standard of ***excellence*** in teaching, tenure stream faculty must demonstrate teaching skills that reflect competence on criteria A.1-A.4 described above, as well demonstrate excellence in teaching as outlined below in some combination of criteria B.1-B.4. For promotion to the rank of Professor based on excellent teaching, candidates must have consistently met the standard of excellence set out below, sustained over many years.

### **1. Using Teaching Practices that Promote Student Learning**

- Integrating innovations in teaching including using new and/or exemplary teaching processes, materials, technologies, or forms of assessment
- Using an evidence-informed approach to design learning activities, assignments, courses, or curricula that motivate student learning
- Being recognized for teaching through nomination for or receipt of awards / honours
- Creating opportunities for undergraduate and/or graduate students to engage in the research or scholarship process (e.g., presenting or publishing with students, mentoring / coaching students)
- Actively integrating one's own research or scholarship into teaching, clinical practice or curriculum
- Using professional expertise to deepen student understanding and enrich the application of theory (e.g., designing unique learning experiences for students in practice settings, enabling students to build relationships to local communities and communities of practice)
- Receiving invitations to teach outside of assigned courses because of own expertise (e.g., in academic or practice settings).

### **2. Active Engagement in Curriculum Development**

- Making significant and ongoing contributions to curriculum development (e.g., development of a new course, development of innovative materials, development of creative forms of evaluation, ongoing development of effective / improved curriculum [innovation, revisions, updating, evidence-informed improvements]).

### **3. Engagement in Professional Development**

- Consistently applying developmental learning activities to inform nursing practice, education, research / scholarship, and/or leadership (e.g., participation in workshops, seminars, conferences, courses, committee work, or engagement with formal related associations).

#### **4. Educational Leadership and / or Achievement**

- Actively engaging in the professional development of others (e.g., delivery of workshops, seminars, or presentations on teaching and learning, active engagement as a teaching mentor to colleagues, providing mentorship and establishing best practices in the management and leadership of teaching assistants and other instructional team members)
- Engaging in professional teaching and learning associations or teaching centres
- Engaging in the scholarship of teaching and learning (e.g., conducting projects on teaching and / or learning that have impact beyond a single classroom, disseminating one's own pedagogical scholarship [scholarly publications or educational resources, presentations at conferences or workshops], applying for grants to complete projects)
- Creating significant new pathways to promote students' professional skill development
- Serving as a journal reviewer or editor of pedagogical publications or as a proposal referee for pedagogical conferences
- Contributing to the scholarship of nursing (e.g., publications, conference paper / poster presentations, panel membership, conference organization)
- Contributing to pedagogical and/or professional development in nursing or a broader educational context (e.g., development of education materials such as textbooks or teaching guides, production of technological tools or multi-media resources that enrich teaching and learning, receiving invitations to serve as a curricular or program evaluator for another department or institution, being actively engaged in accreditation processes)
- Contributing to the development of the nursing profession (e.g., committee or forum leadership / participation with professional organizations; formally advocating for nursing profession issues; informing and contributing to policy and professional directions at key provincial, national, or international organizations).

## **PART 2: ASSESSMENT OF TEACHING EFFECTIVENESS FOR TEACHING STREAM FACULTY**

### **2.1 Continuing Status Review and Promotion Criteria for Teaching Stream Faculty**

For faculty in the teaching stream, *The Policy and Procedures on Academic Appointments* (2015) (Section 7, Part 30, vi) outlines how performance is assessed in general terms:

*Performance will be assessed on teaching effectiveness and pedagogical/ professional development related to teaching duties in accordance with approved divisional guidelines on the assessment of teaching. Administrative service will be considered, where such service is related to teaching or to curricular and professional development.*

The Policy describes the specific criteria to be met for continuing status as follows: A positive recommendation for continuing status and promotion to Associate Professor, Teaching Stream, requires “*the judgement of excellence in teaching and evidence of continued future pedagogical/professional development.*” (*Policy and Procedures on Academic Appointments*, Section 7, Part 30, x)

*a) Excellence in teaching may be demonstrated through a combination of excellent teaching skills, creative educational leadership and/or achievement, and innovative teaching initiatives in accordance with appropriate divisional guidelines.*

*b) Evidence of demonstrated and continuing future pedagogical/professional development may be demonstrated in a variety of ways e.g. discipline-based scholarship in relation to, or relevant to, the field in which the faculty member teaches; participation at, and contributions to, academic conferences where sessions on pedagogical research and technique are prominent; teaching-related activity by the faculty member outside of his or her classroom functions and responsibilities; professional work that allows the faculty member to maintain a mastery of his or her subject area in accordance with appropriate divisional guidelines.*

*The Policy and Procedures Governing Promotions in the Teaching Stream* (2016, Part 6), outlines the criteria to be used for promotion to the rank of Professor, Teaching Stream:

*Promotion to Professor, Teaching Stream will be granted on the basis of excellent teaching, educational leadership and/or achievement, and ongoing pedagogical/professional development, sustained over many years... Administrative or other service to the University and related activities will be taken into account in assessing candidates for promotion, but given less weight than the main criteria: promotion will not be based primarily on such service.*

Administrative service, where such service is related to teaching or to curricular and professional development, will also be considered to assess performance for the purpose of continuing review and promotion in the teaching stream. These duties can include the coordination of undergraduate or graduate programs and administration of large undergraduate courses. Effective service in academic administration can also be considered as evidence of pedagogical/professional development related to teaching duties. However, as specified in the Policy and Procedures Governing Promotions in the Teaching Stream (Part 10), administrative service will be given less weight than the main criteria: promotion will not be based primarily on service.

## **2.2 Criteria for Assessment of Excellence in Teaching for Teaching Stream Faculty**

Teaching stream faculty demonstrate their effectiveness as teachers in a number of teaching and learning contexts including classroom teaching / lecturing, on-line teaching, teaching in seminars and tutorials, teaching in the simulation laboratory, clinical teaching or supervision within assigned courses, individual teaching, delivery of workshops, and any other means by which students derive educational benefit.

Assessment of excellence in teaching for the purposes of continuing status and for promotion in the teaching stream requires faculty members to demonstrate excellence through a combination of excellent teaching skills, creative educational leadership and/or achievement, and innovative teaching initiatives.

### *A. Excellent Teaching Skills*

Teaching stream faculty are expected to demonstrate excellence in teaching skills within each of the following criteria:

#### **1. Enacting the fundamental duties of a university teacher by**

- Demonstrating mastery of the subject matter(s) being taught / learned by students
- Using effective communication skills in teaching and learning
- Being accessible to students
- Consistently dealing equitably and ethically with all students
- Demonstrating professionalism and adhering to academic standards as defined by the University of Toronto and the Faculty of Nursing
- Creating and sustaining learning environment conditions that are conducive to students' academic progress, intellectual growth, and development and application of research knowledge and skills.

**2. Using teaching practices that promote student learning by**

- Communicating academic materials effectively, including professional knowledge
- Challenging and stimulating students to promote their intellectual and scholarly development
- Assisting students to master the subject area(s) being taught
- Using meaningful methods of assessment
- Providing timely constructive feedback to students
- Engaging students in the learning process
- Using student feedback and student outcomes to enhance own teaching practices
- Using professional expertise to deepen student understanding and enrich the application of theory (e.g., designing unique learning experiences for students in practice settings, enabling students to build relationships to local communities and communities of practice)
- Being recognized for teaching through nomination for or receipt of awards / honours
- Receiving invitations to teach outside of assigned courses because of own expertise (e.g., in academic or practice settings).

**3. Actively engaging in curriculum development by**

- Demonstrating understanding of the context of one's own course(s) within the broader curriculum as well as in relation to curricular developments across faculty programs
- Respecting program integrity and requirements
- Ensuring that course curricula reflect current and relevant research and practice in the fields of nursing and health care in general
- Making significant and ongoing contributions to curriculum development (e.g., to a course, development of innovative materials, development of creative forms of evaluation, ongoing effective curriculum or program development [innovation, revisions, updating, evidence-informed improvements]).

*B. Creative Educational Leadership and/or Achievement*

In addition to excellent teaching skills, as outlined above, for the purpose of continuing status and for promotion in the teaching stream, faculty must demonstrate some combination of the following elements of creative educational leadership and / or achievement:

- Being actively engaged in promoting the educational / professional development of others (e.g., delivery of workshops, seminars, or presentations on teaching and learning, active engagement as a teaching mentor to colleagues, providing mentorship and establishing best practices in the management and leadership of teaching assistants and other instructional team members)
- Developing significant new courses and / or reform of curricula
- Creation of significant new pathways to promote students' professional skill development
- Contributing to the development of the nursing profession (e.g., committee or forum leadership / participation with professional organizations; formally advocating for nursing profession



issues; informing and contributing to policy and professional directions at key provincial, national, or international organizations)

- Serving as a journal reviewer or editor of pedagogical publications or as a proposal referee for pedagogical conferences
- Contributing to pedagogical and/or professional development in nursing or a broader educational context (e.g., development of education materials such as textbooks or teaching guides, production of technological tools or multi-media resources that enrich teaching and learning, receiving invitations to serve as a curricular or program evaluator for another department or institution, being actively engaged in accreditation processes).

### *C. Innovative Teaching Initiatives*

In addition to demonstrating excellence in teaching skills and evidence of creative educational leadership and/or achievement, teaching stream faculty must demonstrate development and use of innovative teaching initiatives that enhance student learning by:

- Integrating innovations in teaching including using new and/or exemplary teaching processes, materials, technologies, or forms of assessment
- Using an evidence-informed approach to design learning activities, assignments, courses, or curricula that motivate student learning
- Creating opportunities for undergraduate and/or graduate students to engage in the research or scholarship process (e.g., presenting or publishing with students, mentoring / coaching students)
- Actively integrating one's own scholarship into teaching, clinical practice or curriculum.

### **2.3 Criteria for Assessment of Pedagogical / Professional Development for Teaching Stream Faculty**

Teaching stream faculty must demonstrate evidence of continuing pedagogical/professional development in a variety of ways, including:

- Engaging in developmental activities that support own effectiveness as teacher, nurse, and/or leader
- Engaging in the scholarship of teaching and learning (e.g., conducting projects on teaching and / or learning that have impact beyond a single classroom, disseminating one's own pedagogical scholarship [scholarly publications or educational resources, presentations at conferences or workshops], applying for grants to complete projects)
- Engaging in discipline-based scholarship relevant to the field in which the faculty member teaches
- Participating in and contributing to academic conferences where sessions on pedagogical research and technique are prominent
- Consistently drawing on current research and other developments in one's field to advance student learning and to enrich own teaching

- Engaging in teaching-related activity outside of his/her classroom functions and responsibilities
- Engaging in professional work that allows the faculty member to maintain a mastery of his/her subject area
- Consistently applying developmental learning activities to inform nursing practice, education, research / scholarship, and/or leadership (e.g., participation in workshops, seminars, conferences, courses, committee work, or engagement with formal related associations)
- Using developmental opportunities to enhance one's teaching practices
- Reflecting on and striving for improvement in teaching activities
- Engaging in professional teaching and learning associations or teaching centres
- Contributing to the scholarship of nursing (e.g., publications, conference paper / poster presentations, panel membership, conference organization).

#### **2.4 Additional Criteria for Promotion to the Rank of Professor, Teaching Stream**

For promotion to the rank of Professor, Teaching Stream, candidates must consistently meet the standard of excellence in teaching and demonstrate ongoing pedagogical/professional development (as set out in sections 2.2 and 2.3, above), sustained over many years. When reviewing candidates for promotion to the rank of Professor, Teaching Stream, educational leadership and / or achievement (section 2.2.B) is also assessed as a separate criteria, distinct from teaching excellence. This assessment is undertaken in accordance with the *Policy and Procedures Governing Promotions in the Teaching Stream* (Part 9), which indicates that:

*Sustained over many years, educational leadership and/or achievement is often reflected in teaching-related activities that show significant impact in a variety of ways, for example: through enhanced student learning; through creation and/or development of models of effective teaching; through engagement in the scholarly conversation via pedagogical scholarship, or creative professional activity; through significant changes in policy related to teaching as a profession; through technological or other advances in the delivery of education in a discipline or profession.*

## **PART 3: DOCUMENTATION AND EVALUATION**

### **3.1 The Teaching Portfolio**

Each faculty member should maintain a **Teaching Portfolio**, which should be updated annually and serve as a foundation for the documents that will be required for the interim or probationary review, tenure or continuing review, and promotion. Evidence outlined in the candidate's Teaching Portfolio is a required documentation source to assess effectiveness of teaching. Faculty are advised to retain documents that reflect success, experimentation, and innovation in teaching.

Materials in the Teaching Portfolio should include:

- Candidate's Curriculum Vitae
- A statement of teaching philosophy
- All course outlines, all teaching assignments, and teaching assessment activities. For promotion to Professor in the Tenure Stream, policy requires that these should be provided for the past five years. The *Policy and Procedures Governing Promotions in the Teaching Stream* (December 20, 2016) requires that teaching stream faculty provide these "for at least the last five years"
- New course proposals
- Digests of annual student evaluations and letters or testimonials faculty have received from students regarding teaching performance and outcomes
- Description of formal supervision of students, if applicable
- Applications for instructional development grants or similar documents
- Documentation on efforts made (through both formal and informal means) to improve teaching skills or course design and a description of the outcomes
- Awards or nominations for awards for teaching excellence
- Documentation concerning innovations in teaching methods and contributions to curricular development, including activities related to the administrative, organizational, and development aspects of education and the use and development of technology in the teaching process
- Examples of efforts to mentor colleagues in the development of teaching skills and in the area of pedagogical design
- Evidence of professional contributions in the general area of teaching, such as presentations at pedagogical conferences or publications on teaching
- Service to professional bodies or organizations through any method that can be described as instructional
- Community outreach and service through teaching functions.

### **3.2 Evaluation of Teaching Effectiveness**

The evaluation of teaching effectiveness must be as thorough as possible. Sources of information for the evaluation should include the following:

1. The candidate's Teaching Portfolio
2. Student course evaluations
3. Letters from students (solicited by the Office of the Dean) who have been taught and/or supervised by the faculty member
4. For tenure stream faculty, data that will enable the Committee to assess the candidate's success in graduate (particularly PhD student) supervision, including number of students supervised; quality of theses produced; quality of supervision; number graduated; time-to-degree completion; and information on other efforts to foster scholarly and professional advancement of graduate students
5. Descriptions of innovations in teaching and contributions to curricular development
6. Formal peer evaluation by an internal Teaching Committee, and other departmental, divisional, or colleague assessments where cross-appointment is involved.
7. For the purposes of continuing status review and promotion in the teaching stream as well as for tenure review of faculty in the tenure stream, evaluation will include reports from one or more classroom / online course assessment visits
8. For continuing status review and promotion in the teaching stream, confidential written assessments of the candidate's teaching, ongoing pedagogical / professional development and for promotion, their educational leadership and/or achievement must be obtained from at least three referees who are specialists in the candidate's field from outside the University. One of these external assessments should be from a referee suggested by the candidate.